



**MULTICULTURAL MEDIA TELECOM AND INTERNET COUNCIL, INC.
RESOLUTION OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

**A Public Apology to Alex Nogales, National Hispanic Media Coalition,
and the MMTC Community for Erroneous BBSJ Post**

WHEREAS, on Thursday, May 7, 2015, MMTC staff posted online and distributed by email an op-ed in its Broadband and Social Justice weblog authored by Rob Atkinson that had appeared in the March 2015 issue of *The Innovation Files*, the Information Technology and Innovation Foundation's (ITIF) blog. The op-ed, which was about net neutrality and the digital divide, attempted to use the memory of Cesar Chavez to disparage National Hispanic Media Coalition President and former MMTC Advisory Board member Alex Nogales.

WHEREAS, the post was re-published in error, without having been subjected to the appropriate internal editorial review, the post and all links and references to it were immediately removed. However, and regrettably, recipients of the emailed version of the post were not notified of the error. Further, on Friday, May 8, 2015, MMTC's President and CEO Kim Keenan, upon being notified of the post, immediately sent a written apology to Mr. Nogales, who served on MMTC's Advisory Board, expressing her apology and how much MMTC values our three decades-long relationship with NHMC and with Alex personally. Shortly thereafter, and despite additional verbal apologies to Mr. Nogales and attempts by MMTC's CEO and COO to resolve the matter with him directly, Mr. Nogales announced his resignation from the MMTC Board of Advisors. MMTC issued a press release and published a formal apology to Mr. Nogales on May 20, 2015, in our BBSJ weblog and on the MMTC website: <http://broadbandandsocialjustice.org/2015/05/mmtc-on-resignation-of-advisory-board-member-alex-nogales/>; <http://mmtconline.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/MMTC-Press-Statement-Resignation-of-Advisory-Board-Member-Alex-Nogales.pdf>. Unfortunately, however, this apology was not emailed to the subscribers of the Broadband and Social Justice newsletter. As a result of this incident, MMTC staff have now established a more rigorous internal review process for all external content, called "Principles of Engagement," which will govern best practices for content published by MMTC and by others who sign on to the Principles.

WHEREAS, MMTC's Board of Directors deems it in the best interest of all parties that the MMTC Board of Directors issue a public apology to Mr. Nogales, to the National Hispanic Media Coalition, and to any other members of the MMTC community who may have been offended by this post.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Directors hereby issues this public apology to Mr. Nogales, the National Hispanic Media Coalition, and to all concerned, direct that MMTC's CEO send this apology to Mr. Nogales and further directs that this resolution be posted on MMTC's website.

Submitted for adoption this 15th day of July 2015 and Adopted.

Julia L. Johnson

Julia L. Johnson, Chair
MMTC Board of Directors



The Multicultural Media, Telecom and Internet Council's Five Principles of Civil Discourse

In today's fast-paced Internet Age, civility often takes a backseat to rhetoric. Social media tools provide an environment for overzealous advocates to generate vicious, sometimes anonymous, personal attacks against those who do not share the same position. An organization serving communities of color should never engage in gutter-level attacks against those with whom it disagrees. Rhetorical assaults that divide communities of color diminish the value of our voices on important issues of telecommunications, Internet, and other social justice policy and have no place in civil discourse.

Only a small number of organizations represent communities of color, and the continuing battle to advance civil rights needs the full and unencumbered efforts of each of them. The differences of opinion among these organizations are much narrower than the differences that exist between these organizations and their ideological adversaries. Therefore, all of those serving communities of color must agree to disagree on issues where their opinions might not align, while coming together on those issues where they share a common goal.

High standards for public advocacy are expressed in these Five Principles of Civil Discourse:

1. **Civil Communications:** We will discuss our differences openly and always adhere to a standard of discourse that expresses appropriate respect for the parties involved. We can disagree without being disagreeable.
2. **Presumption of Ethics:** We will not, without incontrovertible proof otherwise, presume that a nonprofit organization has taken a policy position in exchange for financial compensation, nor will we contact or ridicule a nonprofit's donors in an attempt to discourage financial support. We will assume that other nonprofit organizations have the intellectual capacity and moral authority to make their own decisions and reach their own conclusions.
3. **Backing Up the Facts:** When we make specific, fact-based assertions that another party's position is not for the best, we will provide references to research, scientific evidence, or other available support for our assertions.
4. **No Guilt by Association:** We will not attack nonprofit organizations, individuals, or other parties based on the reputation of an unrelated organization, individual, or party that holds a similar stance on the issue.
5. **Respect for Historic Icons:** We will not invoke the names of the deceased – especially religious or civil rights leaders – as though we know what that leader would have said or

done. Citations to deceased leaders will be limited to statements they clearly made on the specific issue under discussion.

Organizations may implement these Five Principles through heightened prescreening of their media and social media content. Before publishing any document, White Paper, government filing, tweet, or Internet post, organizations should screen the document to ensure compliance with the Five Principles.